



MINUTES OF THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

**MONDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2019, 4:30 PM
CITY HALL, ROOM 310**

A. ROLL CALL.

I. Members: Paul Martzke, Susan Ley, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley, Ron Dehn, Ian Griffiths, and David Siegel

Present: Ian Griffiths, David Siegel, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley and Paul Martzke
Excused: Susan Ley

B. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.

I. Approval of the agenda for the February 11, 2019, meeting of the Landmarks Commission.

Moved by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, seconded by Ron Dehn to approve. Motion carried.

Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES.

I. Approval of the minutes from the January 23, 2019, special meeting of the Landmarks Commission.

Moved by Ron Dehn, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to approve. Motion carried.

Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

D. REGULAR BUSINESS.

I. (COA 19-02) Consideration with possible action on a major facade renovation at 218-224 N. Adams Street

Moved by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, seconded by Ron Dehn to open the floor. Motion carried.
Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

Moved by Ron Dehn, seconded by David Siegel to close the floor. Motion carried.
Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

Moved by Paul Martzke, seconded by Justin Balsley to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness with the understanding that no removal is required of the stained brick or metal facia, and recommending that no further action is taken by LC Staff. Motion carried.
Yes- Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley, No- David Siegel, Abstain- Ian Griffiths

E. INFORMATIONAL.

I. Staff-Level COA Applications

Moved by David Siegel, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to receive and place on file. Motion carried.

Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

2. Review City Raze/Repair Orders and Demolitions

No report.

3. Staff Update

Awards Program, Design Guidelines, and CLG Application discussed. No report.

4. Date of next meeting: Monday, March 11, 2019

F. ADJOURNMENT.

Moved by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, seconded by Ron Dehn to adjourn. Motion carried.
Yes- David Siegel, Ian Griffiths, Paul Martzke, Ron Dehn, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, Justin Balsley,
No- None, Abstain- None

VERBATIM MINUTES

- The Landmark's Commission to order for January 23rd, 2019. We're gonna take the roll. Paul Martzke is here. Susan?
- Here.
- Veronica?
- Here.
- Justin?
- Here.
- Ron?
- Here.
- Ian? And David?
- Both excused.
- Okay, first item on the agenda is the approval of the agenda for today's meeting. Do I have a motion to approve the agenda?
- So moved.
- Second.
- Any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of approving today's agenda signify by saying aye.
- [All] Aye.
- Motion carries. Next item on the agenda is the approval of the minutes from the January 14th, 2019 meeting of the Landmark's Commission. Again, do I have a motion to approve those minutes?
- Motion approved.
- Second.

- Any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of the approval of the minutes from January 14th, signify by saying aye.

- [All] Aye.

- Motion carries unanimously. Onto regular business, consideration with possible action on a window replacement project at 131 North Broadway. This was on the agenda from the previous meeting. It was tabled so that we could get the representative of the project here to discuss it. I think we will maybe just start out with a quick refresher on the background on this by Jason. Is that appropriate?

- Sure, if you like. The property owner here owns the building shown at left. It's a little out of date, it says A Bag Lady. I don't think it's A Bag Lady anymore. The proposed project involves replacing storefront windows with some roller, overhead-type door-windows. As I understand it, only the windows in that area would be replaced, the brick below remains the same. The doors remain the same and the general surround, with the pilasters and the big header across the top stay the same. At our last meeting we briefly discussed of their overhead garage-style doors in historic districts, and I was unable to provide you with any concrete guidance on this.

- Okay. Stephanie, do I need to have a motion to open the floor for discussion, or?

- Yes please.

- Okay, so--

- Motion to open the floor.

- Second.

- Vote on that?

- [All] Aye.

- So, property owner.

- What do you want?

- I think you have to state your name.

- Okay, William Widmer.

- And address I think.

- Do you want the spelling on the last name, Stephanie?

- Ah, I've got that.

- Okay.

- Well, first of all thank you for coming here today. Sorry about, somehow a mis-communication, you didn't realize that we had the last meeting.

- All good. I think that we did talk about this in-depth at the last meeting, and I guess if you want to just give us a quick, brief overview of your intentions of the building, and we've got the drawings and we've kind of seen those. But just explain to us, you know, what you want to do and--

- Yeah, well the two big square panes of glass would come out. They got to put a center post in that's maybe three times as wide as the one in the picture there, so that there's room for a track on each side. And then it'll be segmented glass, probably four pieces, that replaces each one of those square windows.

- Still thermal glass, still aluminum frames, you know. The difference is it'll open and it'll be split into four, horizontally.

- And how would they open?

- They're just standard garage doors, only where there would usually be an insulated panel, there's insulated glass.

- Gotcha.

- Yep.

- What color will the framing be for that?

- Ah, the same color as is on the building, I think is what's on there.

- I think it said anodized, right?

- Yeah, yeah. It's the anodized that type of, that company, that storefront's done in, is not the same company that the garage door comes from, so whether the anodizing matches exactly, probably not, but.

- That's one of the things that we want as a, to keep it in line with other buildings, or with the expectation of a historic, to make it look more historic, is to not have the shiny anodized aluminum.

- Okay.

- But what's on there now, I actually walk by there everyday, I live on that side of town, is like a baked enamel with a sort of tan kind of--

- Right. I mean it is anodized, is what it is. It's anodized aluminum.

- But it's got a baked enamel finish, not just the shiny.

- Right, right.

- It's not just the metal.
- And it may have been shiny too. That metal just kinda loses it's luster over years too, you know.
- Well no, I'm pretty sure it has the baked enamel on it, as I've looked at, one I've looked at, yeah.
- So one of the questions, or one of the things that we talked about the last time was the difference in the way the overhead garage doors make the appearance of the facade look and we've got the example up there of Washington Street.
- Yeah.
- And you can kinda see the two different ways that they treated those openings. And there were two concerns that we had based on those examples. The example on the left has a much thinner mullion pattern than the overhead doors on the right.
- Yeah, on the second floor, there.
- Which we felt was preferential because it looks more characteristic of the size of mullions you'd have in a historic district.
- Okay.
- And from the drawings that were submitted we don't know what the intention is with that overhead door.
- Let's see.
- The second thing that we talked about at length was the actual color of the framing on the door.
- Yeah.
- And I think that the discussion was simply if the framing on the door is a dark bronze color, similar again to what you see on the left.
- Yeah.
- It makes the door essentially disappear and it creates more of a look that it's a full pane of glass which is similar to what your storefront looks like now.
- Okay.
- And so our question was--
- I mean that's fine with me, that's by far the cheapest option. It costs more to change the color away from bronze. So, I mean if that's what you want. I see what you're saying, and from here in a photograph you're probably correct. When you stand right up to it on the sidewalk it's not blending in. I mean it's painfully obvious that there's breaks in the glass, there.

- Right.
- So, but if that's what you guys like, that's the cheapest option. So I'm fine with doing that, you know.
- Part of our concern is that we're setting a precedent here. There isn't really a guideline. So everybody who comes to us from here on out is gonna say, "This was done on this building."
- With the garage door.
- With the, yeah, with the door-window thing. So that was one of the reasons we wanted to get it right, I think .
- Yeah, so what was the previous thing? I know my other business, we did a couple of years ago, Ned Kelly's, and there was none of, this wasn't involved in it. But I mean there was plans and it was approved and whatever, but we never went through--
- There wasn't a--
- So I guess I'm--
- There wasn't an ordinance before.
- Okay.
- This whole commission is new this year.
- Okay.
- And then also Ned Kelly's wasn't in a district at that time.
- Okay.
- It's still isn't, it's not historic.
- Okay.
- So the Broadway is a historical--
- Yeah, you're in the Broadway District.
- Yeah.
- And so that's the difference.
- So where do you, and maybe this has nothing to do with this but just so I understand what you guys are doing, what does the historic, what's your concern when a building has already been, when its historic value has already been stripped of it. I mean 'cause none of the front of that, none of the

windows on the first story, none of the windows on the second story, not that brick, not the concrete on the sides, none of it is how the building was.

- And that's a great question.

- Well, that's what we talked about.

- So.

- Yeah, we had talked about that too.

- Yeah, I mean none of it is-- It's a 1980s building is what it is.

- It's still a contributing building, listed as a contributing building to the district, so you know.

- It was identified as a historically significant building looking as it does now.

- Oh, okay.

- So to put it into perspective, if you had owned that building and all of the treatment that you just talked about, if this commission I'm guessing would probably not allow what we see here to be built.

- Sure.

- If that was brought for us today.

- Okay.

- Simply because it's not similar to the period of significance for that building. And so I think that we can't undo the past, somebody before you or whatnot has done those facade renovations, but what we're trying to do as a commission is still honor the intent of what the National Park Service says is appropriate for a historic district. The compromise that we're making is that, quite honestly, the overhead doors aren't historic at all.

- Right.

- But I think it's the, I don't wanna speak on behalf of everybody here but I think the idea is that we understand that this is popular for businesses, especially in summer months to be able to open up their facades. And so that's why we're looking for some compromise with, well let's do this in a way that's the most sensitive to the original look of the building that we can.

- Okay.

- And so while your facade, we know that the brick on the bottom isn't original to the building, the shape and the size of those two storefront windows you have, though, is probably pretty close to what it looked like originally.

- Sure.

- And so, you know, even if we're maintaining the proportions of those openings, we feel like we're still doing a service to the district and the architecture. You know, likewise in the future if you come back to us and you want to upgrade those windows on the second floor I think the commission is going to recommend that the windows are something that's more historically accurate than something that's just off the shelf at a local home improvement store.

- Sure.

- So that's the intention of it, of the commission is, just to try and balance the needs of the historic district in terms of businesses and their operation and also maintaining the character of the district that brings everybody there.

- Works for me.

- Sounds like a good explanation.

- Done. So what would you guys like?

- If you do make a motion I would just kindly request that you recognize that the dimensions of the fenestration are not being altered and that no historically significant material is being removed and discarded as part of this.

- Right.

- I was wondering too, Jason, if you want to comment, just so you would understand where, what the official federal view is on--

- You know, I can't find any historic landmarks commission that gives a thumbs up to overhead roller doors in a historic district, unless it's on a building that was used for, like, garage purposes.

- Sure.

- Or a gas station or something like that. That's great. I'm kind of a realist, too. I recognize that, hey, we're not doing harm because this material isn't historic, and you know, property owner rights should be respected insofar as it's possible and we're not compromising the historic integrity of the building. So, I'm kind of on your side here.

- Good. That's what I like to hear.

- We should be open to this but at the same time if we say that we're open to it, we need to be able to demonstrate to the next person that this did no harm.

- Yeah.

- That the opening wasn't made bigger, that they didn't tear up something that was old and historic, that, you know, within very set parameters we're okaying this so as to not be locked in a position where we have to okay it for any and every other situation.

- Sure, sure. Well, I mean, it seems to me that a lot of it would have to do with what you were taking out. I mean if that was historic glass and it was all original then I'd feel bad taking it out, but that's not the situation we find ourselves in here, you know.

- I'll go one further though and say that if you were getting rid of that lower brick wall and wanting these doors to go ceiling to ground.

- Yeah.

- That that would really alter the character of the building so much so that we're getting into the red zone.

- Okay.

- Given that you're not changing the size of the opening.

- Yeah.

- I decline to say let's not brag about it too much.

- Sure.

- And then didn't we also have a discussion too about if the two places on Broadway, excuse me, on Washington Street, that it would be preferred that it be more like the glass color on the left than the glass color on the right?

- Well the--

- Where it blends in toward the--

- The stain--

- Where it doesn't stand out itself?

- The state's preservation architect was very adamant that all the glass be clear glass not blowy or reflective. And he was very much against the anodized finish, finished finish so to speak, that he wants a baked on paint or something like that. But in our conversation here we got into the discussion of what are the existing storefront doors finished with?

- Right.

- And would driving one way then make the other stand out in a terrible way that it doesn't already? And these are decorating questions I can't answer.

- The door frame.

- The frames of the doors are also that baked enamel, of the same color that's on the window frame. So it looks like the only thing that's that shiny aluminum is the push in the center. So I don't know, I guess if we do a baked enamel on the roller doors, or. The brown, that's anodized, but not baked?

- It's anodized as well but it's the way that it comes, is anodized. Yeah, basically they can anodize it in several different colors.

- Oh okay.

- And then if you don't want one of those standard colors then they come through and paint them afterwards.

- I see, I got you.

- But the problem is that all of those materials, all those anodized finishes, they all fade out, so.

- So that would have to be matte? It'd be hard to match.

- If we match that it won't be exactly matched.

- Right. So the bronze would be the cheapest and that's what they have on Vintage Cantina.

- I mean if you want, the manufacturer that we'll use on Vintage is the manufacturer that we're using, so.

- Okay.

- The doors on the left there on Vintage Cantina those are much more accurate to, that's a lot closer to the door we're going to have. It's made by the same manufacturer. I don't know whose door is on the nines there.

- Okay.

- Okay, any other discussion? I guess I will go ahead and make a motion that we approve the installation of--

- Do we have to close before?

- Yes, please.

- All right.

- I'll make a motion that we close the floor.

- Second.

- All in favor?

- [All] Aye.

- Hearing none, I will make a motion that we go ahead and approve the installation of the overhead doors at this address, with the stipulation that the framing of the overhead units is dark bronze anodized, and of the smallest profile available, and that the remainder of the facade is, the materials are not removed or replaced as a part of this project, and that the openings are, the openings sizes are maintained as they currently exist.

- Yeah, it's going to be a little smaller in the middle because they got to get two, you know, a track for each door on there. So it won't be the two inches, it's going to come out to like six or seven in the middle there.

- Yeah and we understand that. We'd like to see that center mullion is smaller, kept as small as physically possible.

- Okay.

- We saw the drawing, we saw the framing, but along with what we're trying to get at, the lighter that center post can be we think is more in the spirit of those openings.

- Okay.

- Clear glass.

- Clear glass.

- Yeah.

- I mean the glass is, you're fine with the glass that's there because I just want the glass to match. It doesn't--

- Yeah.

- Right, you're fine with it matching what's there?

- Yeah.

- Okay.

- So, Stephanie, do you want to re-read what I just sort of said, that was sort of added to?

- The following conditions: framing the unit as a dark bronze, anodized and smallest profile available, the remainder of the facade shall not be removed or replaced, the openings will be maintained as they exist, and clear glass to match the existing glass.

- I think that's it.

- I think that was it.

- So that was my motion.
- So I will second that motion.
- Any other discussion?
- I got another question on this building. So right now I'm going to run out of money. So I'm not opening this can of worms now, but I really don't like the brick that's below those windows.
- We don't disagree.
- So if at some point in time I want to deal with that brick what is your recommendation? What would you like that portion to look like?
- I think we could find out first what was there originally.
- It's going to be missing because I've seen it from the inside, and there's nothing, that's not going over something, it replaced something. So unless there's an old photograph out there.
- But that's why I was wondering, like at the Neville.
- Yeah, I don't know, possibly, you know.
- A lot of those storefronts, and if you look at that picture on the bottom right, a lot of those storefronts didn't necessarily have masonry on the bias. A lot of times it was a wood-framed--
- This one's a little deeper into the 20th century, 1920s, so you know, you could certainly replace that brick and a more economical choice might be a faux paint to match the brick up high in color and stuff. I've seen that done quite, like, amazingly well on other buildings. But then you get into a paint cycle of trying to keep that up too.
- Right.
- You'd want it to match the brick that's above, ideally, right? I mean that would be the--
- Ideally.
- And you wouldn't want to change, you still wouldn't want to change the size of the fenestration?
- Yeah, ideally. If we could find an old photograph then, you know, that provides a pretty good idea for what--
- I know a lot of them, if you look at like the historic photograph there on the bottom right, a lot of times, too, that was, you know, concrete or almost exclusively mortar, which worked before they salted roads and sidewalks the way they do now. But with concrete down there now it just gets eaten away.

- Yeah, like a storm.
- So, I don't know.
- We can look for photos for you, too you know, just see what we have.
- If you were doing it, that's even better yet.
- West side book too.
- West side book?
- Yeah. It's right over there.
- Okay.
- But there are some old photos and an album might have something too.
- All right.
- They could maybe do some digging for you.
- Sounds good.
- Okay so--
- See Mary Jane at the second floor of the library.
- All right.
- I think we have a motion and a second, so we discussed and we're at the point of a vote.
- And it has been approved.
- Great. That would take care of that item. At this point I don't think we have anything else on the agenda. Our next meeting is Monday, February 11th. Unless there's any other business that anybody would like to discuss, I would look for a motion to adjourn.
- Motion to adjourn.
- Second.
- Second.
- All in favor?
- [All] Aye.

- All right, thank you, everybody.
- All right.
- Thank you.
- Good luck to you.
- Easy enough, thank you.
- When do you plan to open?
- Probably the end of March.