



MINUTES OF THE PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

**TUESDAY, JUNE 11, 2019, 4:30 PM
CITY HALL, ROOM 207**

A. ROLL CALL.

I. Members: Ald. Bill Galvin, Chair, Ald. Kathy Lefebvre, Vice Chair, Ald. Barbara Dorff, Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax

Present: Barbara Dorff, Kathy Lefebvre, Bill Galvin, Veronica Corpus-Dax

Others present: Fire Chief David Litton, Finance Director Diana Ellenbecker, Chief of Staff Celestine Jeffreys, Human Resources Director Joe Faulds, HR Operations Manager Melanie Falk and others.

B. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.

Moved by Ald. Barbara Dorff, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to approve the agenda.
Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES.

I. Approval of the minutes from May 14, 2019.

Moved by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, seconded by Ald. Kathy Lefebvre to approve. Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

D. REGULAR BUSINESS.

1. Consideration with possible action on request by Ald. Galvin to examine and determine salary and benefits for the Oak Learning Center at the Wildlife Sanctuary to see if other funding sources can be used to get their pay and benefits closer to GBAPS salaries and benefits.

Moved by Ald. Barbara Dorff, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to hold this item until the next Personnel Committee meeting and for staff to review the salaries of these positions. Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

E. INFORMATIONAL.

1. Memorandum of agreement between the City of Green Bay and Green Bay Fire Fighters Local 141 on creating a committee to assist in researching and testing equipment and apparatus prior to purchases.

Moved by Ald. Barbara Dorff, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to receive and place on file. Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

2. Report of routine personnel actions for regular employees.

Moved by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax, seconded by Ald. Barbara Dorff to receive and place on file. Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

3. Next meeting date: July 9, 2019.

F. PUBLIC HEARINGS.

G. ADJOURNMENT.

Moved by Ald. Barbara Dorff, seconded by Ald. Veronica Corpus-Dax to adjourn the meeting. Motion carried.

Yes- Barbara Dorff, Bill Galvin, Kathy Lefebvre, Veronica Corpus-Dax, No- None, Abstain- None

Fair Labor Standards Act 7G Agreement

Position	Regular Rate	My Proposed 7G	S.C.B.A. Pay Rate \$1.5506	Overtime Rate
Private (6+ Paramedic)	\$25.84	\$26.84	\$27.39	\$38.76
Engineer (11+ Paramedic)	\$27.07	\$28.07	\$28.62	\$40.61
Lieutenant (17+ Paramedic)	\$28.92	\$29.92	\$30.47	\$43.38
Captain Paramedic	\$30.86	\$31.86	\$32.41	\$46.29

VERBATIM MINUTES

- Personnel Committee meeting, with roll call.
- Alder Dorff here.
- Alder Corpus-Dax present.
- Alder Kathy Lefebvre present.

- And I'm here, so all are accounted and present.
- Director Faulds, do you have the recorder that you want us to start?
- I do not.
- Okay.
- I forgot it.
- All right.
- So, what's going on, are we being recorded or no?
- We're being recorded, it's going to work.
- Okay, all right.
- All right.
- Is that wood?
- Real wood?
- I think so.
- All right, I'll look for a motion on the agenda.
- Move to approve the agenda.
- Second.
- I have a motion to approve by Alder Dorff, second by Alder Corpus-Dax. All in favor?
- [Together] Aye.
- Look for a motion on the minutes.
- Motion to approve.
- Second.
- I have a motion to approve by Alder Corpus-Dax, second by Alder Lefebvre. All in favor?
- [Together] Aye.

- Okay, that passes unanimously. Now onto regular business. Consideration with possible action on a request by Alder Galvin to examine and determine salary and benefits for the Oak Learning Center at the Wildlife Sanctuary to see if other funding sources can be used to get their pay and benefits closer to what the Green Bay Area Public School's salaries and benefits are. Staff?

- So we do have a memo attached, and then attached to the memo is the, I guess, the costs to the budget for the benefits and the salaries. So what we have for the projected cost would be, if you look on the first page of the Excel spreadsheet, when you look at the second row where it says \$64,263.17, that's what we project would be the cost. That could be more if our premiums go up based on our health fund, but we don't know that at this time. And then with the amount of funding that the City's going to receive, it will increase this year. But the intention is to use that increased funding for the program. If you need to add any additional furnishing to the new building, or just put it back in the 4K program. So at this time, we don't have any additional funding sources for the benefits, but that's what we have presented.

- Alder Dorff?

- Thank you. So I would object to using this increase for anything but salary or benefits. And so what I did was I went and got the salary schedule from Green Bay schools, and also the amounts that are paid, the hourly rate for bilingual or special education paras, which I think naturalists are about that. So can you tell me how much our teachers are paid?

- Yeah, it's in here for the salary here, and the second page of it, where it has the \$37,576.80.

- Oh yeah, that's right.

- Where is that, on the second page of, oh, down there, there we go.

- Yeah, so that's the total cost we have for the 4K teachers and the naturalists.

- And the naturalists, is it a salary or an hourly rate?

- It has an hourly rate.

- Of, what's the hourly rate then?

- I just looked at it.

- Yeah, that's what it would be for--

- I don't have it off the top of my head, but I can get that to you.

- That would be important, because the Green Bay teachers, at step zero, bachelor degree, is \$40,406.00. And step one is usually where you're hired at, step one, \$41,486.00. So here's my thoughts. We take, it will get about \$16,000 to \$18,000 more, right, for giving the \$200 more per child, my understanding.

- Yeah, I think it's in here, is it not, in my notes. Yeah, I think it's \$16,000 if it was a full 80 students.

- Yeah, \$16,000. I understand that there's no way we can pay benefits with that, I get it. It doesn't come close to touching that. But the memo that was written, or in the communication from Alder Galvin, also talked about increasing the salary. So what I'd like to do is bump them up, using that money, and if there's anything left over, then to go ahead and have the leftovers put--

- So you want to move them up to zero or step one?

- I want to, step one, 'cause that would be--

- That would be about just under \$4,000 apiece.

- Well, for two people it would be.

- Well that would come out to close to--

- I need to know the hourly, because the range, for a program like that it should be closer to the \$21.53 an hour, do you think it's anywhere?

- So the hourly rate for the naturalist is \$13.90.

- Huh!

- Really?

- Okay.

- Look what they're making, they're making \$22,000 a year before taxes.

- I get it, okay. Well then the para's salaries range from \$18.53 to \$21.53. I wonder what happens if we go with the \$18.53, go to the bottom, the base of a para for the naturalist, and then see how much money we've got left and divide that between the two teachers. If it doesn't get us to the \$41,486.00.

- One thing I just want to add before we start going forward is Director Ditscheit could not be here tonight because the Park Committee's meeting tonight. And I think he'd probably better suited to answer the questions of his intentions to use the funds, but we can go ahead with what you're proposing. But I'd think it would be prudent to have him here to--

- It would be, but I also have spoken with the school board members that have been on that committee, and they said their full intent that was very well known to the City, was that money was to be used to increase salaries and benefits. It was not to be used, that was the spirit of the district choosing to give more money. So I don't know where the breakdown was, unless you just wrote that memo, which it didn't seem like you could have, that wasn't just your memo, because Dan Ditscheit's name wasn't even on that.

- Yeah, I wrote this memo.

- Does he know that you wrote that memo?
- Yes, he does.
- So he knows what the content of the memo was?
- Yes.
- Oh, okay, good, because the spirit of the negotiations with the district was the money would be given to the teachers and the naturalists, whether it would be salary or benefits. And I had said that when they were doing that, I said guys, that is not going to come anywhere close to benefits, and they knew that. But it certainly, the spirit of it was not to use it to put for future expansion or stuff, you know. And so when do we, I suppose we have a little time, because the school year doesn't start 'til August. But we don't have a lot of time.
- No, if he can't be here by, we can table this until the July meeting.
- And that's it.
- That's it.
- Well I think--
- And then you can have an answer, how much it would be, if we did \$18.53 an hour.
- You can figure out the hourly and get it back to us.
- \$18.53 an hour.
- An hour, that's the bottom of the salary schedule, and that's last year's salary schedule. I'm not even proposing we go to next year's, which is what the Green Bay teachers, but let's just go to last years, and then the \$41,486, let's try to get to step one.
- Yeah, and one thing I would like to add too, talking to Director Ellenbecker and Director Ditscheit is that I think when we budget, it's typically not the full 80 students because we're not for sure if it's going to be at max capacity every year, so I think that's just a prudent way to budget the whole year.
- Yeah, but we also, prudently, have to start looking at these people as our employees because they are our employees. And we don't treat our other employees like this that are full-time employees, do we? We give them health benefits, right?
- I think for, yeah, for--
- I don't even know how legally we can even get away with this, are we saying they're seasonal, I mean, how do you legally not give--
- [Woman] They're on contract.

- Yeah, their contract is limited term.
- Limited term contract, even though really it is, if you're a teacher in a school district, you couldn't be considered that if you had a year to year job. Yeah, I just feel like, if they're going to be our employees we need to care about them as our employees, and take care of them.
- It's very easy for me to say yes. I mean we want to treat all of our employees like they're people, we want to give them the best benefits and salary that we can, it's just, I'll say yes to that every time, it's just finding the funds for it.
- Right, yes.
- Finding the funds, but do we have any other employees we treat like this in the city? Other than the CSIs, and they're not full-time.
- Right, any other?
- Who?
- Who?
- [Woman] They accepted this position at this rate.
- Well sure.
- [Woman] And they're at a 33% increase on their wage. They're making \$13.90 an hour right now as a 4K naturalist.
- Right.
- Yes, I don't want to give them that, they shouldn't be making what other--
- When I started as a cadet here, you could have paid me a two bucks an hour, I would have taken the job at that time. It wasn't until reality settled in that--
- But the thing is we'll lose these people.
- [Woman] Well other employees 33% pay increase as well.
- Right, you'll always have turnover.
- We will have so much turnover. These are very vulnerable children, they're four years old. It is a dangerous place, coyotes running around, that did actually happen, and water, things like that, we need experienced people, we want to keep them.
- Because that's been a problem, we have not had the same teachers year to year, have we, or naturalists?

- Yeah, we've had a lot of turnover. I think the reason why the salaries and the hourly rate is what it's at is because of the funding that we get from the school district, that's why, that's why it's unique to these employees, and that's why they're treated this way.

- Otherwise, let's just give it up, they give it all over to the school system.

- And when we talk to the school is, with school choice, a school is getting like \$5,000 or \$6,000 per student.

- Well, these are half-time kids remember. Each child is only.

- All right, okay.

- It's halftime, FTE, you have to really divide FTE in two. 80 is really 40.

- But the teachers are working full time, because they've got half-time kids in the morning, and half-time kids in the afternoon.

- Yes, they are, but so 80 kids really translates to 40 FTE, and we're getting pretty close to \$5,000 if we get \$2,500 per kid.

- Right.

- Well actually that would be exactly \$5,000, so.

- Yeah, I believe the funding is directly related to what the State funds their staff.

- They do get more help, they do though, they do. But now we're going to be, we're can be pushing them too. This has to be good for everyone, the kids, the employees, and that's why I didn't want to put a percentage increase, I don't, I don't want to say let's now increase them this percent because it would not be realistic that every year we'd, but now they have a base and then every year they might get what the City gets, the 2%, or you know, every year with Tony Evers as our governor, we might be getting more money. And the children are getting more money, per student. That might continue so then we might still get more money. So I don't really want to really say, yeah, we're giving them a 33% increase. No, we're trying to do a base, a basis, okay, thank you.

- I'll entertain a motion.

- To what, to hold this until the next--

- I would table it, and have staff with the direction that we gave them what we're looking for.

- Okay, hold it, not table it, right.

- Right, table it, well, hold it.

- Hold until the next meeting.

- Hold it at committee.
- With staff looking at it.
- Yeah, a motion to hold, do I have a second.
- Second, I'll second it.
- Okay, I have a motion to hold and a second, all in favor?
- [Together] Aye.
- Any opposed? That passes unanimously.
- Boy, that was it.
- And then what we have--
- Informational.
- Yep.
- Right.
- Then we have, next up is the Fire Department.
- That's just informational?
- No.
- No?
- [David] Yeah, it is informational.
- It is, if you don't want action on it, okay. And then after that, anyone have any questions on report of routine personnel actions?
- Well do we have any questions on the report of the Fire Department?
- Yeah, I think we should take up the MOU first and then just explain it, and let the Committee know what we've done.
- Okay, sure.
- So we have Chief Litton here to explain item number one under informational.
- So in the past, the history of the Department and the Contract, we have had side letters of agreement or Memorandums of Understanding with the Fire Fighters union which were signed by the

Human Resources Director, the Fire Chief, and when there was no major change in the Contract, just things that came up structurally or whatever. So in the past, and I'm going to have to be careful about what I'm saying here because we are not in closed session. There were committees that were formed to do certain work for the Fire Department. And they just did it. In 2018 we had a committee formed for the rescue tools that the Council approved for purchase, so we went out to bid on that. But during that time we did an evaluation of the tools, and at the end of that, that committee, the members of that turned in for overtime at the time and a half rate. So under the Fair Labor Standard Act, federal law, we are required to pay the time and a half on that. However, under that same Fair Labor Standard Act for public safety employees, because we work extended hours, there's something there called the 7 exemption, and which never actually in the history of the State of Wisconsin in the fire service, there's never been a 7 exemption agreement. They're very prevalent in Illinois and other Midwestern states and all over the country actually, but there's never been one done in Wisconsin. So I went to the union and said look, if you're going to be looking for payment on these committees I have one of two options. Either I'll just tell you what you're getting, which is not a good situation because I'm not the one in the field using it, I sit behind a desk, right. Or we can do this 7 agreement which will agree to a rate which is much less than the time and a half rate, but above your regular rate, and we can run it that way. So over a year's time we were going back and forth. They got their attorney involved. We were talking with our staff and with HR. And essentially we got down to a point where, and I'm just going to give you just a chart here which will make it simple for you, because it will be very, I'll be talking numbers, and you'll be looking at me like, what are you talking about. But hopefully this will bring it all together for you.

- Thank you.

- Thanks.

- Thanks.

- I see.

- So, do you want one of these? So if you look in the left column there, all the way down, that's the four pay levels in our contract. Private, six plus paramedic. There's actually an entry level, 18 month level, but these are for primary positions that we're talking about on these committees. So in the first column on the top, second column on the top, regular rate, so that's the regular rate that their salaries break down to on an hourly basis. And when I was talking about this to them I proposed a rate \$1.00 above their base rate. And they went through a series of things, and they came back and they finally, after going back and forth a bunch, they came back and said, we've already got this SCBA Tech rate, which is the third column over, in the contract, and we'll agree, so instead of \$1.00 extra, they'll agree to \$1.55, \$1.5506.

- Rather than the \$38.76?

- [David] Rather than \$38.76.

- I think that's pretty close.

- [David] So this is the first 7 agreement in the City, and the first one in the State of Wisconsin in any contract, and so instead of paying the overtime rates, we're going to be paying these agreed upon 7

rates at the much reduced rate. And the only way you can exempt this stuff, so for instance, firefighting is a very dangerous job, so it has to be non-hazardous duty. So things like sitting on a committee, where we are reviewing equipment, when they are reviewing spec for an ambulance, or when they're reviewing heart monitors, things of that nature that are not hazardous that are basically office work, or very controlled environments, this is where we can use these 7 rates.

- All right.

- That makes sense.

- So you guys are off-duty when you're doing this work.

- [David] Well, when we do a committee, we have to do it by the contract, by seniority, most qualified by seniority. We can write some parameters in there of people that we want to see A-capped info with this station, and we can say you want this, this, and this. So in any given committee there is generally seven people. So of that you might have three of them on duty. So they're just being paid because they're here. The other four would be getting this 7 rate.

- But the other people won't be getting extra money, right.

- [David] The on-duty people, no, because they're already being paid.

- All right. Where was I going to go with this? Just give me a second.

- If I can, I just have one question.

- [Bill] Sure.

- Is that, so in the past, these memorandums have not come to personnel, we've just seen, especially when we have the union and the management agree to it, it's usually a very good thing, so in the past we haven't got these, and this MOU, it's difficult to have any kind of MOU that has no impact on the budget, it's either going to decrease or increase it slightly. So with the new Personnel Committee, it's informational because in the past we have not brought it for your input. And I guess what I'm asking the Committee right now is do you want to have more input on these MOUs, would you like for us to just keep you in the loop, and since it's not an action item tonight, think about it, maybe send me an email, or give me a call, let me know what your thoughts are, if I can just, or if you want more input from the Chief and I, to just contact the Chair, or how you guys want to go forward with this. Typically this is what we did with the sergeants with the Police Department, when we were adding positions, we brought that to the Personnel Committee.

- [Bill] All right, I guess bring it to us in the future. Are you guys going to be doing away with seniority at some point here, like the Police Department is?

- [David] We are in open session here.

- We are in open session here, oh yeah.

- Well I mean I'm talking about for selection of committees, and that kind of stuff.

- Well we're still in open session.
- Is that still an un-open session issue.
- [David] I guess I can answer you very directly because it's not an unknown position to the Union that I am absolutely going to be pressing removing seniority from the contract.
- Okay.
- All right, enough said. All right, I'll entertain a motion.
- We don't, do we need a motion.
- [David] So you can receive and place on file with the informational items.
- Okay.
- Okay.
- Move to receive and place on file.
- Second.
- All in favor?
- [Together] Aye.
- All right, thanks so much for your description. Actually this is a huge savings for us.
- Yes it is.
- Yes, yes.
- It is a huge savings, yeah, thank you. Maybe you could give it to the Police.
- [David] And it can be applied in other areas of the City.
- Well, exactly, this should be something that sets the groundwork for other groups.
- Right, right.
- So the next one.
- Okay, next one is Personnel Moves, anyone have any questions about those, I have none.
- Bye.

- No questions on all terms.
- All right, so that, we can just--
- Move to receive--
- Receive and place on file.
- Second.
- Second, okay, all in favor.
- [Together] Aye.
- That passes unanimously. And I think that is it.
- So our meeting date stays July 9th for this one.
- Right, yeah, so, I'll entertain a motion to adjourn.
- So moved.
- Second.
- All in favor?
- [Together] Aye.
- We're outta here.
- I'm outta here. I am gone.
- Drive safe.
- Thank you. Hopefully the rain is done.
- Yes, it is.